

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting February 21, 2019

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, February 21, 2019, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Barbara Wingo, Vice-Chairperson
Toni Wallace
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE the January 24, 2019 meeting minutes as presented. The motion SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wallace, Weaver, Wingo,
Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOTION

Ms. Wingo MOVED to APPROVE the January 17, 2019 special meeting minutes as presented. The motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Duncan announced the withdrawal of item 6(a).

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to APPROVE the Agenda. The motion SECONDED by Ms. Wingo and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

5. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness 2019-0005– Les Thomas Architect, Inc. – Applicant
Scot and Susan Bebry – Owner
57 Marine Street (a.k.a 154 Avenida Menendez)

To make alterations to an existing Certificate of Appropriateness to include enclosing a section of the proposed first story rear porch, altering the proposed front staircase and the front wall, adding new windows, and removing the stairs leading to the second story porch.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **57 Marine Street (a.k.a. 154 Avenida Menendez)** with the following condition:

1. The applicant redesign the window on the western elevation to make it more compatible with the historic building.

Les Thomas agreed to staff conditions and waived the presentation.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application 2019-0005 with the condition as indicated in the staff report. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Demolition 2018-0118 – Charles M. Sapp and Emily S. Pugh – Applicant and Owner **160 Oneida Street**

To demolish a building constructed in 1894 that is a contributing building to the Lincolnvile National Register Historic District and that is listed in the Florida Master Site File.

Applicant withdrew the application prior to the meeting.

6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness 2018-0121 – Don Crichlow & Associates – Applicant **Steven and Linda Lohrke – Owner** **320 Charlotte Street**

To construct a second-story onto an existing one- story Frame Vernacular home and to build a two- story garage apartment.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **320 Charlotte Street** with the following conditions:

1. HARB finds that the alterations conform with the AGHP and with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.
2. The pergola is reduced in size to fit a residential scale
3. The window on the eastern elevation of the secondary structure is centered or a second window is added

Don Crichlow reviewed the application regarding changes from the previous plan, including removal of the two-story garage.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed the following:

- Staff recommendations
- Zoning concerns, including the rear non-conforming rear and side setbacks

- Non-conforming to Secretary of the Interior Standards due to impact of the historic roof fabric and building profile
- Slab on grade construction not recommended
- Pergola on front with staff recommendation to reduce size
- Finished floor elevation of the addition lower than the pier foundation of existing structure
- Small roof connection between existing house and proposed addition was set back from the pergola
- Reduction in pergola size
- Pergola as a car port did not match the era of the building
- Secretary of the Interior Standards for Historic Preservation as applicable to the rear addition
- New elevation was an improvement to previous submittals
- Importance of short pier foundation, one foot in height to side addition
- Proposed front window ok

MOTION

Mr. Weaver **MOVED** to **APPROVE** Certificate of Appropriateness application 2018-0121 with the conditions that the addition be on 1 foot high piers, that the north and south planes of the structural components of the pergola be brought in one half-foot on either side, and the portion of the pergola south of the structural post be eliminated. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. (c) Certificate of Demolition 2018-0161
– TBL Construction, Inc. – Applicant
Fishbites Trading LLLP – Owner

190 Nix Boat Yard Road

To demolish a structure constructed in 1967 that is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places or in the Florida Master Site File.

Applicant was not present.

There was Board consensus to move the application to the end of the agenda.

The item was re-visited after item 8(b); however, applicant remained absent.

MOTION

MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0161 to the March 21, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

6. (d) Certificate of Appropriateness
2018-0175 – A.D. Davis Construction –
Applicant
St. George Street Properties – Owner
30 St. George Street

To replace the existing wood siding with a composite siding.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said staff cannot make a recommendation on the replacement, composite material because there is no clear guidance in the AGHP or the SOIS regarding replacement of the entire siding of a historic building in a composite material. She added that the Historic Preservation Master Plan recognizes that the AGHP needs to be updated to reflect modern materials.

Mike Davis reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi spoke in opposition to the application.

Les Thomas spoke in favor of considering the use of the proposed materials, but not for reconstructions of historic buildings or for use on St. Augustine historic district buildings. He did agree with utilizing the product only on the sides where the public could not see and not on the front.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Cordova Street project which used same material was judged based on Secretary of the Interior Standards and not guided by the AGHP because it was not in a historic district
- Secretary of the Interior Standards which outlined the appropriateness of a replacement material that had the same look and feel of the original material
- Material could be used to assist with historic preservation; however, the AGHP did not necessarily allow the use of the material
- SHPO letter stated that material replacement should be like-for-like.
- Considering composite materials in the AGHP updating process
- AGHP sections that did not allow the replacement composite siding

Mr. Davis encouraged the Board to reconsider the AGHP and make changes that could benefit the protection of historic structures through the utilization of composite materials.

The Board discussed the possibility of alternative wood with different profile that could be more waterproofed on the north side where it would not be seen by the public.

There was brief discussion regarding further consideration of alternative materials within the AGHP because of the sustainable nature and durability of composite materials.

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to DENY Certificate of Appropriateness application 2018-0175 to replace the existing wood siding with a composite siding because the Board did not have the authority to approve a composite material based upon the AGHP. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) 2019-0007 – Marion Motor Lodge – Applicant

J Prabhu LLC – Owner
120 Avenida Menendez

To apply marble chip stone onto an existing knee wall.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **120 Avenida Menendez** based on SOIS 2 and 3.

Matt Patel produced a sample of the product and reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Material was not compatible and did not match any historic masonry walls in the area
- Stucco may be a simple, cost-effective material and other options included coquina.

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to DENY application 2019-0007 to apply marble chip stone to an existing knee wall. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wallace, Weaver, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (b) 2019-0008 – Garden 54 LLC – Applicant TIITF/Department of State – Owner 54 St. George Street

To make alterations to an existing outdoor space to include planting new vegetation and installing pavers and granite for walkways, a wood deck, two small walls, and decorative elements.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **54 St. George Street** to give the applicant time to address the issues described in the staff report.

Shawn Duffney and Gerald Dallaire reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Property ownership and authority to make the application
- Fountains were not appropriate in the historic district and had been denied previously
- Desire to see existing site plan to compare with proposed changes
- Request that the applicant research appropriate architecture and landscaping for the building's time period and style

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE Certificate of Appropriateness application 2019-0008, 54 St. George Street, to the March 21, 2019 meeting based on staff recommendations and Board discussion to allow the applicant to work with staff to choose more period-appropriate decorative elements. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Benoit, Wallace, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY¹

8. Certificate of Demolition and Partial Demolition

8. (a) 2019-0004 – Bigger Pot LLC – Applicant and Owner 1008 North Ponce de Leon Avenue

To demolish a structure that was constructed in 1967 that is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places or recorded in the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff

¹ Brief recess from 3:09p.m. to 3:15p.m.

finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **1008 North Ponce de Leon Avenue** with the following condition:

1. Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include completing a Florida Master Site File Form and taking photographs of the structure. These documents will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with courtesy copy provided to staff.

Mark Hodges reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

14 certified notices were sent, 5 were returned in favor and 5 had comments.

Public hearing was opened.

Charles Pappis noted that the PZB rulings were based on the size of the existing building and wondered whether those would need to be reconsidered.

B.J. Kalaidi asked about the existing billboard on the property and noted that the building was not a contributing structure to a historic district or on the National register of Historic Places and would likely be approved for demolition.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board noted that there was no testimony that would warrant looking into the structure as a historic landmark.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application 2019-0004, 1008 N. Ponce de Leon Avenue. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, Benoit, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (b) 2019-0006 – Les Thomas Architect, Inc – Applicant
Confidential – Owner
15 Cincinnati Avenue

To demolish a building constructed in 1924 that is not a contributing structure to the North City National Register District but is recorded on the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary to indicate that the building meets criteria for significance, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **15 Cincinnati Avenue** with the following condition:

1. The applicant records the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and scaled drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with courtesy copy provided to staff.

Les Thomas and Irene Arriola reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

20 certified notices were sent, 7 were returned in favor, and 5 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application 2019-0006, 15 Cincinnati Avenue with the conditions that the applicant provide, for archival purposes, photographs and scale measured drawing to be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

There was discussion regarding modifying the motion to include salvage of any original construction materials where possible.

Mr. Weaver AMENDED his motion to include the condition that historic materials be salvaged if feasible. The amendment was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. Planning and Building Staff Approved Permit Report

Ms. Wolfe noted that the report was for informational purposes to allow the Board to ask questions regarding Staff-approved permits, if they deemed necessary.

10. Other Business

10. (a) Discussion regarding any recommended updates to the 2016 HARB Rules of Conduct

Ms. Duncan and Ms. Wolfe introduced the subject and the Board discussed the following:

- Revision of the presentation process could include a more thorough staff presentation which may add time to the meetings

- Ensuring that Board discussion and decisions were based on code and guideline criteria
- Ex parte communications could be limited to written communications; however, state law may inhibit the prohibition of ex parte communications in general
- Site visits were allowed so long as they were disclosed
- Recommendation that economic hardship be considered as a separate application or be somehow separated in the hearing process for clarity purposes
- Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as components of a motion
- Include language that did not allow applicants to join discussion once a motion was on the table
- Further discussion regarding economic hardship and possibility of HARB design review for demolition applications based upon economic hardship
- Attempts to avoid incentivizing demolitions

Ms. Wolfe noted the following items pertaining to the subject had been addressed:

- Ex parte communications
- Consideration of a brief, consistent, staff presentations of each application brought before the Board
- Economic hardship
- Forming motions

10. (b) Announcements regarding upcoming workshops

Ms. Wolfe referenced the handout included in the Board packets that outlined upcoming workshops, training, and conferences.

**11. Review of Conflict Statements from
Previous Meetings**

(None)

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the
meeting was adjourned at 4:40 P.M.²



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

² Transcribed by Candice Seymour