

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting March 21, 2019

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, March 21, 2019, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL: Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Toni Wallace
Paul Weaver, III

Absent: Barbara Wingo, excused
Jon Benoit, excused

City Staff: Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the February 21, 2019 minutes as presented. The motion SECONDED by Ms. Wallace and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Duncan announced that the applicant for Item 9(a) requested a continuance; and, due to Board member absence, the discussion regarding flood plain management would be continued to the April 18, 2019 meeting as well.

Mr. Weaver also noted that the application for 64 Washington Street had been administratively withdrawn.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the Agenda. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Demolition F2018-0161 – TBL Construction, Inc. – Applicant
Fishbites Trading LLLP – Owner
190 Nix Boat Yard Road

To demolish a structure constructed in 1967 that is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places or in the Florida Master Site File.

Applicant was not present.

There was Board consensus to move the application to the end of the agenda and hear the item if the applicant arrived.

Heard after item 7b

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **190 Nix Boat Yard Road** with the following condition:

1. Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include completing a Florida Master Site File Form and taking photographs of the structure. These documents will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master File with a courtesy copy provided to staff.

Tyler Brandon Lee was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board explained the condition to record the structure for the Florida Master Site File.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0161, 190 Nix Boat Yard Road, because the structure did not meet the criteria for a historic building and with the condition of recording and photographing the building for the Florida Master Site File as discussed and detailed in the staff report. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2019-0008 – Garden 54 LLC – Applicant
TITF/Department of State – Owner
54 St. George Street**

To make alterations to an existing outdoor space to include planting new vegetation and installing pavers and granite for walkways, a wood deck, two small walls, and decorative elements.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **54 St. George Street** to give the applicant time to address the issues described in the staff report.

There was Board discussion regarding the late submittal of additional information and changes.

Gerald Dallaire and Michael Quatromony reviewed the application.

The Board and staff gave guidance regarding the approval process, the archeological survey requirement, and the need for timely and clear submittals to enable staff and the Board to review the application fully. There was brief discussion regarding certain planting choices such as the Queen Palm with a recommendation that plantings come from the approved list within the AGHP.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Charles Pappis testified that the Queen Palm was not native to Florida.

Public Hearing was closed.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0008 to the April 18, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) F2019-0019 – 29olives – Applicant Baker Family Revocable Trust – Owner 132 St. George Street

To request approval for a sign that utilizes colors that are not pre-approved and unique font and illustrations.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **132 St. George Street**.

Kristen Billyer reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi spoke against the application citing concerns for future deviations from the AGHP.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Desire to see approved green color
- Font did not meet AGHP requirements
- Willingness to continue the application to seek alternatives or have applicant work with staff to find

a font that would not require HARB approval

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0019 to the April 18, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (b) F2019-0023 – Extreme Window & Door Solutions Inc. – Applicant Wilma R. Delorenzo Revocable Trust of 1995 and Delorenzo Trust – Owner 74 Marine Street

To replace the existing wood windows with vinyl impact windows.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **74 Marine Street** to give the applicant time to provide a window condition assessment and to consider a more compatible window type.

Derek Crosby reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi spoke in opposition to the application due to vinyl not being an approved material in the AGHP.

Charles Pappis asked questions regarding the light dividers in the impact windows.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- No recollection of HARB approving vinyl windows in the past
- Structure was built in the colonial style and wood was only appropriate material
- Potential repair of any of the existing wood windows
- Need to see window condition assessment
- Desire to see evidence of prior approval of vinyl windows
- Possible replacement of only the windows beyond repair

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0023 to address the items in the staff summary and analysis to include a window assessment report with a determination as to whether some windows could be repaired and consideration of alternatives to the proposed vinyl replacement windows. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Weaver, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (c) F2019-0024 – Doris A. Vidan – Applicant and Owner 298 St. George Street

To replace existing wood windows with wood clad windows and to replace the existing door with a different design.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **298 St. George Street** with the following findings:

1. The existing windows are beyond repair
2. The replacement windows are compatible

Doris Vidan reviewed the application noting that the door would be wood and not fiberglass.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Window replacement would be at the rear of the building
- Muntin profiles
- Recommended staff findings
- Wood clad windows
- Desire to see drawings of the proposed windows to compare with existing

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0024 to the April 18, 2019 meeting to address concerns from the Board including the need to see a drawing that would compare the existing windows to the proposed. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

There was a discussion regarding requiring a condition assessment report.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificates of Demolition and Partial Demolition

8. (a) F2019-0020 – Southern Group, LLC.
– Applicant
St. Augustine Society, Inc. – Owner
64 Washington Street

For partial demolition to include removing a window and filling in the opening on the front of the symmetrical façade for a building constructed in 1930 that is listed on the Florida Master Site File and contributing to the Lincolnville National Register District.

Item was administratively withdrawn.

8. (b) F2019-0021 – Jeri K. Jewell –
Applicant and Owner
56 Coquina Avenue

For partial demolition to include removal of the split flat and shed roof characteristic of the mid-century style to be replaced with a traditional hip roof for a building constructed in 1955 that is listed on the Florida Master Site File but not listed in a National Register Historic District.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **56 Coquina Avenue** with the following condition:

1. The applicant records the building for archival purposes to include scaled drawings and photographs that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff.

Jeri Jewell and Steve Helvey reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

17 certified notices were sent, 3 were returned in favor.

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi was concerned with the loss of historic integrity in the area that would allow for a future National Register Historic District.

Public hearing was closed.

Ms. Jewell explained that the roof was being removed to allow for the lifting of the structure.

The Board discussed:

- Lifting of the building
- Replacing with similar style roof was infeasible for wind-load and massing reasons

MOTION

Mr. Weaver **MOVED** to **APPROVE** Certificate of Demolition application F2019-0021, 56 Coquina Avenue, for a partial demolition to include the removal of the existing roof with the condition as outlined in the staff report to document the existing roof. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. Preliminary Design Approval for the
Design Standards for Entry Corridors

9. (a) F2019-0025 – Wright Firm –
Applicant
A. Wright Property, LLC. – Owner
317 Anastasia Boulevard

For design approval for an architectural style undefined in the Anastasia Boulevard Design Standards with associated modifications for a pre-

manufactured residential structure to be placed on a vacant lot.

Applicant requested a continuance prior to the hearing. See Modification and Approval of Agenda for motion to continue.

10. Certificate of Appropriateness – City Owned Property

10. (a) F2019-0022 – City of St. Augustine General Services – Applicant City of St. Augustine – Owner Toques PI and Hypolita Street Parking Lot

To alter an existing stucco wall on Hypolita Street.

Ms. Mitchell gave a brief presentation regarding the details of the application and noted that staff did not make recommendations regarding City projects.

Tim Shields, Facilities Manager, and Steve Armstrong were available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi asked who owned the Hypolita Street Parking lot. She felt that there was a way to look into the history of the wall. She asked that the application be continued until more information was found.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Unknown history of the wall
- Site-line study to determine what amount of the wall needed to be removed for safety purposes
- Possibility of totally removing sections of the wall, rather than shortening them

- Existing wall height met AGHP and served as a screen for the parking lot
- Existing wooden slats were an element of colonial architecture but were in need of repair and were expensive to maintain
- Desire to see drawings that clearly describe safety concerns that required lowering and/or removal of the wall
- Existing wall was damaged and needed to be rebuilt or repaired
- Screening of parking lot was necessary

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0022 to the April 18, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

There was discussion regarding incomplete applications and utilizing a pre-hearing meeting for potential applicants to review applications with staff prior to being placed on the agenda. There was emphasis on the importance of consistency in applications and facilitating the application process.

11. Planning and Building Staff Approved Permit Report

(Included in packet but not discussed)

12. Other Business

12. (a) Presentation by City Building Official and discussion regarding flood plain management in the city and adopted revisions to the city building code

Discussion was moved to the April 18, 2019 HARB meeting to allow absent members of the Board to participate.

12. (b) Discussion and adoption of updates to the 2016 HARB Rules of Conduct

Ms. Wolfe gave an overview of the subject and previous Board discussion. She noted that the City Attorney's office was working on template language for forming motions.

There was discussion regarding ex parte communications. The Board also discussed time limits on re-advertising after a certain number of application continuances.

Public comment was opened and the Board heard comment from the following member of the public:

- Charles Pappis

There was further discussion regarding the order of applicant presentation, Board discussion, public comment, and applicant rebuttle.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the HARB Rules of Conduct updates as amended. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Ms. Mitchell announced that this was Ms. Wallace's last meeting and staff and the Board thanked her for her service.

13. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:54 P.M.¹



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

¹ Transcribed by Candice Seymour