

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting July 18, 2019

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, July 18, 2019, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Barbara Wingo, Vice-Chairperson
Paul Weaver, III
Gaere MacDonald

Absent: Jon Benoit, excused

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

Mr. Weaver noted that in the June 20, 2019 minutes on page 2 in the right column, the motion should read "running bond" rather than "bone," and on pg 4, regarding the fence height at the Spanish Bakery he wanted to clarify that he also supported the shorter fence height because it was clearly a screen for modern, mechanical equipment.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the March 14, 2019 and June 20, 2019 minutes with the above corrections. THE MOTION WAS APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Duncan announced the withdrawal of item 6(a) and the requested continuance of item 6(b) to the August meeting. She asked

for feedback from the Board regarding reversing the hearing order for items 7(d) and 8(a) so that the demolition of the existing structure could be discussed prior to the design for its replacement.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0064 to the August 15, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the Agenda. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. MacDonald and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Expedited Hearing items

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

**6. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2019-0057 – TEP, Inc. – Applicant and
Owner
25 King Street**

To remove and replace sections of an existing storefront.

Item was withdrawn by applicant prior to the meeting.

**6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2019-0064 – Vista Hotel III, Inc. –
Applicant and Owner
16 Avenida Menendez**

To make alterations to an existing hotel to include constructing new elevators and a second story walkway.

Applicant requested a continuance to the August 15, 2019 meeting prior to the hearing. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

**7. (a) F2019-0071 – Nikki C. Gordon –
Applicant
Scott J. and Nikki C. Gordon – Owner
287 St. George Street**

To install Bahama-style shutters on multiple exterior windows.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can take one of the following actions for **287 St. George Street**:

- **APPROVE** the shutters if the applicant can prove that such shutters have been used in St. Augustine or on the home, or;
- **APPROVE** the use of shutters with the condition that the applicant use a more traditional style

Nikki Gordon reviewed the application with additional photographs.¹

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Recommendation of a bungalow-style louvered shutter which would be more appropriate than the shutters proposed but would function similarly
- Aluminum was not an appropriate material for the shutter

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0071 to the September 26, 2019. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**7. (b) F2019-0075 – Les Thomas Architect – Applicant
Historic Fraser Properties – Owner
5 St. George Street**

To construct a kiosk facing St. George Street.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **5 St. George Street** with the following condition:

¹ Attached to original minutes

- The door design is altered to a more compatible design

Les Thomas and Phil McDaniel reviewed the application with the alteration of the door to be a half-door with two shutters which match the side elevation windows above rather than a Dutch door.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi did not see the need to clutter St. George Street with more commercial business. She was concerned with the removal of the tree and spoke against the application.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Proposed modification to the door design was appropriate
- Removal of the palm tree, with recommendation to replant, replace, or shift the kiosk to sit beside it
- Kiosk was located on Fraser property and not city right-of-way
- Shutters would only be 1.5 feet each and would not block right-of-way when opened

MOTION

Mr. MacDonald MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0075 at 5 St. George Street to construct a kiosk with the modifications to the door as presented and with good intentions to find a location for the tree. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

**AYES: MacDonald, Weaver, Wingo,
Duncan
NAYES: NONE**

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (c) F2019-0076 – Les Thomas Architect – Applicant

Dobosz Family Trust (Kenwood Inn) – Owner

243 Charlotte Street

To raise an existing building, construct a second story porch, enclose a single window, and extend the existing exterior staircases to accommodate raising the home.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **243 Charlotte Street** to consider the following:

- Is three feet above BFE the minimum alteration necessary and/or did the applicant demonstrate the proposed elevation is necessary to avoid flooding impacts
- Is the trellis an appropriate deck covering when it is more traditionally used as a landscape element
- Revising the stucco-finished piers to a material already used in the existing foundation

Pat Dobosz and Les Thomas reviewed the application with plans clarifying some staff concerns.²

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi noted that people were concerned that while lifting historic buildings could save them, it could also damage the character of historic neighborhoods.

² Attached to original minutes

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Existing coquina piers were minimal and some were concrete with a coquina veneer
- There would be no stucco utilized for the project
- Extent of damage during Matthew and Irma
- Subject building was not part of the Kenwood Inn
- Proposed height higher than required and a concern for how the change in height affected neighboring buildings
- Recommended alteration of the design along the bottom of the house by dropping the banding or extending the siding downward to make the lift height of the house appear to match neighboring structures
- Recommendation to utilize landscaping to mask the taller piers under the structure
- Minimum height the structure could be lifted to both protect the structure and blend with the scale of the rest of the neighborhood needed to be explored further
- No shutters would be used on the house
- Historic property walls and landscaping which would need to be removed for construction would be replaced
- Second story trellis and removal of the upstairs window were unorthodox, but not inappropriate
- Recommendation from staff that the coquina not be utilized around the concrete piers to avoid conjecture
- Possibility of continuing the item to see the changes discussed reflected in the design, and reconsider the height of the structure

- Request from applicant to approve the porch and window removal and continue the lifting and other design elements of the structure

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0076 to construct a second-story porch, enclose a single window, and the trellis and to CONTINUE the raising of the structure to the August 21, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY³

7. (d) F2019-0072 – Donald A. Crichlow – Applicant and Owner 302 St. George Street

To construct a two story structure meeting the characteristics of a Garage Apartment.

Heard after item 8(a).

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **302 St. George Street** with the following conditions:

- The porch door utilizes a more compatible design
- A pre-approved plant is used instead of the dwarf azaleas
- A more compatible window configuration is used for the second story window on the eastern elevation.

³ Brief recess from 2:19p.m. to 2:26p.m.

Don Crichlow reviewed the application with additional drawings that addressed staff concerns.⁴

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi was concerned with the use of the property as a rental and wondered whether the property would have a new parcel number. She questioned where both the tenant and property owner would park.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Window design was appropriate for bathroom use
- Possibility of adding additional window in the second floor bedroom
- Clarification that there would be a Cordova Street address for the property, but the existing lot would not be divided
- Recommendation that west elevation balcony be centered on the garage door portion
- Flooding and the elevation of the garage
- Window would be a wood fixed window

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2019-0072, 302 St. George Street, with the condition that the west elevation porch be shifted slightly to the south to have the left side align with the garage door below and give the design more balance. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. MacDonald.

⁴ Attached to original minutes

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, MacDonald, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Demolition

8. (a) F2019-0073 – Donald A. Crichlow – Applicant and Owner 302 St. George Street

To demolish a garage constructed prior to 1942 that is not listed in the Florida Master Site File or on the National Register of Historic Places.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for the garage at **302 St. George Street**.

Don Crichlow reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication the Board provided their ex parte communications.

16 certified notices were sent, 6 were returned in favor, and 1 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. MacDonald MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0073, 302 St. George Street, for the demolition of the existing structure. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: MacDonald, Duncan, Weaver, Wingo

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. Certificate of Appropriateness – City Project

**9. (a) F2019-0074 – City of St. Augustine,
Mobility – Applicant
City of St. Augustine – Owner
Various Addresses (Parcel ID:
1961500001, 1961900000, 1113200000,
2134101000, 2035600001, and
1593100000)**

To install bicycle racks and wayfinding signs for a bike share program.

Ms. Mitchell said staff does not provide recommendations for City projects.

Xavier Pellicer, Mobility Coordinator for the City of St. Augustine and John Amihud of Gotcha reviewed the application with a presentation.⁵

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Bike speed could be limited on the bike based on local laws
- Bikes would be equipped with a bell and lights on the front and back
- Proposed color was similar to the preapproved color Burma Jade
- Bike rack and locations did not appear to block view-scape in historic areas as they would be placed where a car would typically be parked
- City logo would be smaller than the sample board presented
- Signage profile would not block view of buildings along the streets
- Minor adjustments of rack locations may be administratively approved

MOTION

⁵ Attached to original minutes

Mr. Weaver **MOVED** to **APPROVE** Certificate of Appropriateness application F2019-0074 with the Pantone color proposed and the condition that minor adjustments to location may be handled administratively but new locations within the HP Districts or any National Register districts come back to the Board. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**10. Planning and Building Staff
Approved Permit Report**

(Provided for informational purposes)

11. Other Business

(None)

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:24 P.M.⁶



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

⁶ Transcribed by Candice Seymour