

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting August 15, 2019

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, August 15, 2019, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Barbara Wingo, Vice-Chairperson
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III
Gaere MacDonald

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

The Board heard comments from the following members of the public:

- B.J. Kalaidi

There was a brief discussion regarding the city resident requirement for HARB members and the difficulty in finding qualified architects within the city to serve on the Board.

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the July 18, 2019 minutes as presented. Motion SECONDED by Ms. Wingo and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

(None)

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness F2019-0064 – Vista Hotel III, Inc. – Applicant and Owner 16 Avenida Menendez

To make alterations to an existing hotel to include constructing new elevators and a second story walkway.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for 16 Avenida Menendez with the following conditions:

- The Board makes the finding that the metal stair covering and the screening are appropriate and compatible alteration to the structure
- The applicant gets approval from the Planning and Zoning Board for the current lot coverage and setbacks.

Sarah Ryan reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi reiterated that the metal material was inappropriate according to the AGHP and should be denied.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Change to white trim color to reflect existing trim
- Projection of the walkway in the Hypolita Street elevation
- Application did preserve the Mediterranean Revival Style
- Metal screen would identify as a modern addition
- Second floor walkway would add additional interest to the Hypolita Street wall
- Pierced metal was widely used in Mediterranean architecture and the applicant provided examples
- Metal awning would read as a non-historic addition

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application 2019-0064. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

Mr. Benoit AMENDED his motion to include approval with the condition that they obtain the appropriate Planning and Zoning approvals for lot coverage or other planning and zoning issues and with the finding that the additions do meet secretary of the interior standards 2, 3, and 9. The amended motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, MacDonald, Weaver, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2019-0076 – Les Thomas Architect –
Applicant
Dobosz Family Trust (Kenwood Inn) –
Owner
243 Charlotte Street**

To raise an existing building, construct a second story porch, enclose a single window, and extend the existing exterior staircases to accommodate raising the home.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **243 Charlotte Street** with the following condition:

- The applicant uses brick or coquina for the pier foundation.

Les Thomas reviewed the application. He stated his client did agree to do a brick veneer on the piers.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Recommendation to start with at the bottom of the house so the windows don't appear too high in relation to the floor
- Concern for the height in relation to surrounding structures
- Compatibility of twelve foot floor elevation with a recommendation to

discuss elevated pier foundation designs for future reference

- Maintaining scale by utilizing horizontal lattice pattern
- Recommendation to reconsider porch design so lattice panels were not as tall
- City floor elevation requirements were 1 foot above Base Flood Elevation
- Creating a consistent best practice for raising historic structures
- Concern that banding and lowering the siding would decrease architectural integrity because the structure did not historically have a band board
- Applicant's preference for landscaping to mask the raising of the structure
- Considering window height on the first floor to reduce the distance from the bottom of the siding to the sill which may alter historical character of the building
- Removing lattice from porch and adding plantings

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0076 finding that a target elevation of three feet above City base flood requirement of nine feet with the condition that the piers be of brick, and that the lattice is as shown and the siding is dropped as presented in the most recent drawings. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Weaver, MacDonald, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificate of Appropriateness – City Project

7. (a) F2019-0080 – City of St. Augustine, General Services – Applicant **City of St. Augustine – Owner** **75 King Street**

To re-install large, lighted metal letters on the front of City Hall/Alcazar Hotel.

Ms. Mitchell said staff did not provide recommendations for city projects.

Bob Harper, Lightner Museum Director, reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Question of whether the existing signage on the front of the building would be removed or re-located
- Letters were part of the original plans for the hotel and were installed before 1900
- Otto Lightner removed the sign when the building became the Lightner Museum
- There was pictorial evidence of the existence of the letters

MOTION

Mr. MacDonald MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0080. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: MacDonald, Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Planning and Building Staff Approved Permit Report

(Provided for informational purposes only)

9. Other Business

Mr. Benoit facilitated a discussion regarding elevated foundations. He presented examples of elevated foundations and architectural features that helped scale the foundation.

The Board discussed:

- Deciding what types of architectural features would be compatible with St. Augustine's structures but still decrease the visual impacts of elevated foundations
- A recommendation for application requirements that detail elevated foundations and utilizing existing data to help form general guidelines or multiple examples that an applicant could choose from
- Deciding what height would be appropriate for elevating structures
- Ensuring a structure was not out-of-scale for the neighborhood as the deciding factor in previous applications
- Possibility of setting a design-flood elevation
- Impacts of elevated structures on the safety of the home during wind events as well as neighboring view sheds
- Historic Structure Impact studies being conducted by the Historical Society in partnership with the City
- Flood mitigation products

Ms. Wolfe reviewed several historic preservation grant-funded projects the City was currently working on.

10. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 2:52 P.M.¹



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

¹ Transcribed by Candice Seymour