

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting September 26, 2019

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, September 26, 2019, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III
Gaere MacDonald

Absent: Barbara Wingo, excused

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Reuben Franklin, Mobility Plan Manager
Andrea White, City Archeologist
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE the August 15, 2019 minutes as presented. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

(None)

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness F2019-0071 – Nikki C. Gordon – Applicant

Scott J. and Nikki C. Gordon – Owner
287 St. George Street

To install Bahama style shutters on multiple exterior windows.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **287 St. George Street**.

Nikki Gordon reviewed the application with the change that there would only be four windows being altered with louvred shutters.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

There was Board consensus that the change from a Bahama-Style shutter to a louvered shutter was amenable.

MOTION

Mr. MacDonald MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0071 to install wood shutters onto the building at 287 St. George Street. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: MacDonald, Weaver, Benoit, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) F2019-0087 – John and Karin White – Applicant and Owner 253 Charlotte Street

To replace all of the existing windows with vinyl windows.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **253 Charlotte Street** to give the applicant time to consider a more compatible alternative.

John White and Joe Fennel reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi spoke against the application citing concern with the incompatible vinyl material.

Charles Pappis noted that a similar application had come in and was only

approved when wood windows were presented to the Board.

Public hearing was closed.

Mr. White responded to public comment noting that he could obtain the vinyl windows in the same historical look as aluminum clad windows that had been previously approved by the Board.

The Board discussed:

- Inability to approve vinyl window based on the AGHP
- Possibility of considering aluminum wood-clad windows if the design was appropriate
- Windows with fins changed the look of the window and the integrity of the window opening
- Necessity of the flange for water-proofing purposes

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application F2019-0087 to the October 17, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Benoit, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (b) F2019-0088 – BP Builders, Inc. – Applicant Daniel Holiday, Jr. – Owner 11 Aviles Street

To make alterations to an existing building to include replacing siding, wood railings, and lighting and installing new siding and planter boxes.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the

Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **11 Aviles Street** to address the finish and to provide a drawing of the Aviles Street elevation.

Bart Piniaz reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Historic photographs of the structure
- Changes to the structure over time
- Bavarian-style projections would be wrapped with siding and planters would be attached
- Windows would be addressed in the future
- Existing stucco was difficult to maintain due to building movement
- Preferred option were to re-stucco or replace with wood siding rather than hardy board
- Building exterior was previously corrugated metal
- Recommendation that proper historic window trim was maintained
- Wall along Artillery Street, stucco would be recessed from siding slightly
- Clarifying stucco finishes, freeze band, and wood siding

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0088 with the intended scope of work to replace stucco on the second floor of the building with a wood novelty siding based on the applicant's demonstration that a similar siding had existed previously on the building and with the condition that the applicant provide to staff a sample of the stucco finish, a sample of the separation

between the stucco and the siding on the second floor, and a sample of the novelty wood siding as well as a sketch illustrating the intended trim around the windows with appropriate reveals. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

Mr. Weaver asked that Mr. Benoit modify his motion to include other changes within the scope of work including the wood railings lighting, and planter boxes.

Mr. MacDonald asked that the motion include documentary photographs throughout construction for historical reference.

Mr. Benoit AMENDED his motion to include requested additions. Mr. Weaver SECONDED the motion.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Weaver, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Property Ad Valorem Tax Exemption

8. (a) F2019-0084 – Tracy VanDusen – Applicant Tracy and Roger VanDusen – Owner 9 Milton Street

To certify the completion of rehabilitation work for an ad valorem tax exemption.

Ms. Duncan recused herself, having provided design-work on the applicant's detached garage.¹

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **9 Milton Street**.

¹ Form attached to original minutes

Tracy VanDusen was available for questions.

The Board provided their ex parte communications.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Historic integrity of the home appeared to have been maintained
- Home was a prime example of a bungalow-style structure
- History of the structure and rehabilitation work

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Ad Valorem Tax Exemption application F2019-0084 for 9 Milton Street. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. MacDonald.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, MacDonald, Benoit

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY²

9. Certificate of Appropriateness – City Project

9. (a) F2019-0089 – City of St. Augustine, Mobility – Applicant
City of St. Augustine – Owner
20 Spanish Street and 5 and 9 Cordova Street

To make alterations to an existing parking lot to include constructing a masonry wall, enhancing the landscape berm, and installing paving material for car and bike parking and sidewalks.

² Brief recess from 2:06p.m. to 2:10p.m.

Ms. Mitchell said staff did not provide recommendations for City Projects.

Reuben Franklin, Freemont Latimer, and Andrea White reviewed the application with a presentation.³

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Feedback from Opinion of Appropriateness discussion had been noted and included in changes to the application, including surfacing and archeological concerns
- Walls along Spanish Street were added to block sight of motor vehicles from Spanish Street
- City Archeologist would perform testing prior to the start of construction if necessary

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application F2019-0089 with the condition that they continue to work with the Archeology Department to preserve and protect those resources. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Weaver, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Planning and Building Staff Approved Permit Report

(No Presentation. Provided for informational purposes only)

³ Attached to original minutes

11. Other Business

The Board Congratulated Kelli Mitchell on her new job and thanked her for her work with the Board.

11. (a) Division of Historic Resources Grant Update

Ms. Wolfe announced the following grant projects for the fiscal year:

- Resilient Heritage in the Nation's Oldest City
- The St. Augustine Survey, including the surveying of West Augustine and the neighborhood around Fort Mose
- Update to National Register and National Historic Landmark District and nominations
- Survey regarding mitigation against future flooding possibly including educational materials for the public

The Board discussed varying ways to mitigate flood impacts in historic buildings and Ms. Wolfe encouraged the Board to continue considering options that could be compiled for public use.

There was discussion regarding alternative materials, including vinyl and aluminum windows, the possibility of updating the AGHP in the future to consider such materials, and concern for maintaining the authenticity of the city when using alternative materials.

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 2:59 P.M.⁴



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

⁴ Transcribed by Candice Seymour