

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting December 19, 2024

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, December 19, 2024, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Gaere MacDonald, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Gaere MacDonald, Chairperson
Brad Beach, Vice-Chairperson
Paul Weaver, III
Absent Catherine Duncan (Excused)
Linda Potter
Barbara Wingo

City Staff:

Julie Courtney, Historic Preservation Officer
Candice Seymour, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Michele Fudo, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

None

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Beach MOVED to APPROVE the November 21, 2024 minutes as presented. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Beach, Weaver, Potter, Wingo, MacDonald
NAYES: NONE
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Item 6.a. was administratively withdrawn.

6.b. was withdrawn by the applicant.

Item 8.a had requested a continuance to the January 16, 2025 Regular Meeting.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the agenda to include the following changes; to administratively withdraw item 6.a. to withdraw item 6.b. per the applicants request, and to continue item 8.a to the January 16, 2025 meeting The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Beach.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Beach, Potter, Wingo, MacDonald
NAYES: NONE
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

NONE

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Demolition (Partial)
HP2024-0050 – Liannys Sanchez –
Applicant and Owner
65 ½ Saragossa Street

Continued from September 18, 2024

For after the fact partial demolition of a residential building, constructed c.1918-1920, contributing to the Model Land Company National Register Historic District, and recorded in the Florida Master Site File, including replacement of historic windows in a different material and design.

This item was Administratively Withdrawn. See item 4.

6. (b) HP2024-0066 – Arkon Builders Corp – Applicant
First United Methodist Church – Owner
118 King Street
Continued from October 17, 2024

For partial demolition and possible reconstruction of the west tower of a church building, constructed between 1910 and 1917, that is recorded in the Florida Master Site File and contributing to the Model Land Company National Register Historic District.

This item had been withdrawn by the applicant. See item 4.

6. (c) HP2024-0072 – KLT Construction, Inc – Applicant
J Prabhu, LLC – Owner
120 Avenida Menendez
Continued from November 21, 2024

To fill in an existing pool area at the southeast corner of the site to expand existing paved parking.

Ms. Seymour read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the board can APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness at 120 Avenida Menendez if the Board finds expansion of the existing parking lot and associated landscaping meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #9 as a compatible contemporary design.

James Whitehouse reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication: none

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- It appeared that the requested information had been provided
- Needed clarification for what materials would be used to build the planter boxes and how wide they would be and also would the plants survive in this environment
- The planters would be placed where the existing wall was and would be the same width as those walls; there would be some landscaping on the inside of the walls
- The applicant would be working with staff
- The plants would be ones that were listed on the approved planting list provided in the code

Mr. Weaver asked the staff to provide clarification with the archeology report. He wanted to know if there had been any inspection or monitoring of the project.

Ms. Seymour advised that the report was not complete; however, there appeared to be no areas of concern.

Mr. Whitehouse stated he had been in contact with the archeology department and advised that no new digging had been done so nothing new had been disturbed.

Ms. Seymour recapped that the A-14 application was not complete when work was started. She advised that the application had since been completed.

MOTION

Mr. Beach MOVED to APPROVE application HP2024-0072 as presented. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Beach, Weaver, Potter, Wingo, MacDonald

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) HP2024-0076 – Len Weeks Construction.Design.Development, LLC – Applicant

Karpeles Manuscript Library Incorporated – Owner
105 Saint George Street

To construct a covered patio space in the rear courtyard.

Ms. Seymour read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the board can take the following actions for a Certificate of Appropriateness at 105 St. George Street:

1. Approve if the Board finds that the proposed new covered patio space meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #9 as a compatible contemporary design that is minimally visible from the rights of ways and is subordinate in mass and scale to the existing structure: OR,
2. Continue to allow the applicant time to modify the proposed design as recommended by the HARB to be more compatible with the colonial building.

Len Weeks reviewed the application.
Ex Parte Communication: none

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

Mr. Weaver said that this was a very significant building that had been restored in the 1960's. He referenced the staff report that spoke to authenticity and using a simple

finish on the building. He said that he agreed with the staff, that the addition did not appear to be fluid with the rest of the building and wanted to know if there could be a break in the roof design. He thought that the roof line looked like a solid line and gave the impression of a large mass.

Mr. Weeks told the Board that the roof dropped down behind the building.

Mr. Beach agreed that the detached structure with a connected cover was a better option, he said that another choice would be to reduce the area of the covered patio which would be more in proportion with the building.

Ms. Potter asked how the size of the pavilion had been determined. She also asked for clarification of the uses of the area as the website indicated that there was space for special events.

Mr. Weaver said that the space was being created to keep the interior space free as it was designed for museum displays. He said that the outside area would be used for classes and lectures.

Mr. MacDonald reviewed suggested changes to the drawings provided by Mr. Weeks, which were changing the roof line while still leaving the building connected to the patio. He made some suggestions as to the materials used and asked if the applicant would have to return or could the new design be administratively approved.

Mr. Weeks liked the board suggestions and added that if necessary, he would return with the landscape plan.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness HP2024-0076 at 105 St. George Street to construct a covered patio space in the rear courtyard with two conditions: 1) there be a smooth finish on the addition and 2) based on preliminary drawings, to be

added to the record, that there be a break in the roof and a cricket feature added to the proposed design, and finally that the arches be segmented. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Beach.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Beach, Potter, Wingo, MacDonald

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Opinion of Appropriateness

8. (a) HP2024-0074 – Bradshaw Building LLC – Applicant

Kresge And Kids LLC – Owner
312 Saint George Street

To remove the existing rear shed structure and construct a new garage with habitable space along Cordova Street.

This item requested a continuance to the January 16, 2025 Regular Meeting. See item 4.

9. Certificates of Demolition and Partial Demolition

9. (a) HP2024-0075 – David Cox & Josephine McElroy – Applicant and Owner 71 Valencia Street

To demolish a residential building, constructed c.1971, that is recorded in the Florida Master Site File and a non-contributing building in the Model Land Company National Register Historic District.

Ms. Seymour read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition at 71 Valencia Street because it is not a local landmark or otherwise designated as a historic building.

David Cox and Josephine McElroy

The Board presented their Ex Parte Communication.

11 certified notices were sent, 1 was returned in favor, 0 were returned opposed and 0 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Staff confirmed that the building was not contributing
- Rear of the house was very low and flooded regularly
- The footings were inadequate and this made it difficult to lift the house
- There would be a new home constructed on the property
- Since the structure was not a contributing structure in the Model Land Company, would the applicant be required to show evidence of the deterioration prior to demolition
- There was a special exception if the structure was in an historic district
- The replacement should match the scale of the neighborhood
- Agreed that mass and scale needed to be taken into consideration
- If care was not taken with the plans, the charm of the area would be lost

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition, a full demolition, HP2024-0075 at 71 Valencia Street to demolish the building with the condition that building permit be pulled within one year. The motion was **SECONDED by Ms. Potter.**

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Potter, Wingo, Beach, MacDonald

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Planning and Building Staff Communications

10. (a) Planning and Building Staff Approved Permits Report

(Provided for informational purposes)

Ms. Courtney advised that the Pena Peck house had a few issues that needed to be dealt with regarding the shutters.

11. Other Business

12. Next Scheduled Meeting Date(s):

12.(a) January 16, 2025

12.(b) January 22, 2025 Special Meeting

13. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 2:19 P.M.¹



Gaere MacDonald, Chairperson

¹ Transcribed by Michele Fudo