

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Communications Media Technology (CMT) Meeting May 21, 2020

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, May 21, 2020, via Communications Media Technology (CMT) and with limited capacity in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Barbara Wingo, Vice-Chairperson
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III
Gaere MacDonald

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Julie Courtney, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Darlene Galambos, City Clerk
Laura Morse, Recording Secretary
Maria Lopes, Office Assistant
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

Ms. Wolfe reviewed the public participation process for the meeting.

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

The Board heard from the following members of the public:

- Gene Hand¹

There was a brief discussion, based upon Mr. Hand's comments, regarding alternative roofing materials.²

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE the April 30, 2020 minutes as presented. Motion SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, MacDonald, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Ms. Duncan announced the next meeting scheduled for June 18, 2020.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

(None)

5. Opinion of Appropriateness

5. (a) F2020-0040 – Marquis Latimer + Halback, Inc. – Applicant
46 Avenida Menendez, Inc. – Owner
46 Charlotte Street

For changes to include ADA accessibility to front and rear porches of building and site features including landscape features, displays, lighting, and property wall.

¹ Additional information attached to original minutes

² Mr. Weaver left the meeting and returned after the applicant presentation for item 5(a).

Ms. Courtney read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the board can **APPROVE** an Opinion of Appropriateness for changes to include ADA accessibility to front and rear porches of building and site features including landscape features, displays, lighting, and property wall at **46 Charlotte Street** because it is generally compatible with the requirements of the AGHP.

Jeremy Marquis and Dustin Felix reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Weaver recused himself.³

The Board discussed:

- Possibility of moving the lift to the north to avoid encroachment on the window on that side of the building
- Rational for lift location to minimize visual impact to the front of the structure
- Rear of the house would not be visible to the street except for the proposed gate
- Request for applicant to show precedent for the proposed wall height
- Recommendation to include a hand-railing for additional accessibility to the porch
- Request for clarification of the pathway to the lift on the site plan
- Concern with exterior renovations of the building that may not have been approved or permitted
- Concern for the lift being placed under the window

- Recommendation for a shorter lift and additional landscaping to screen the lift

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE Opinion of Appropriateness application F2020-0040 to make changes to existing building to improve ADA accessibility at the front porch and at the rear with the recommendations by staff to manage the plant material list to fit within the AGHP guidelines, to work as best they can to mitigate the effect of the lift operator on the front window, and return with further information regarding the alteration on the second floor. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, MacDonald,
Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. Certificate of Demolition

6. (a) F2020-0031 – Sunrise Adventures LLC – Applicant

Chris Klein-Goss and

Robert Ellsworth Goss, Chris Klein-Goss
Revocable Living Trust Agreement –
Owner

100 Menendez Road

To demolish a building constructed in 1945 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is not located in a district.

Ms. Courtney read the staff report and said Based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition at **100 Menendez Road** because it is not a local landmark or otherwise designated as a historic building with the following condition:

³ Form attached to original minutes

1. Archival documentation as per Section 28-89(2)d6: In accordance with Sec. 28-89(2)d6. The board may also require, at the applicant's expense, the recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition. The recording may include, but shall not be limited to, photographs and measured drawings.

Craig Greiner was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

16 certified notices were sent in March, 2 were returned in favor, 3 were returned opposed and 4 had comments.

16 certified notices were sent in May, 1 was returned in favor, 3 were returned opposed and 4 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Home had minimal flooding damage from storms
- Neighborhood concerns for proposed replacement structures
- Concern for cedar trees on the property
- No basis for requiring preservation of the building
- Recommendations for how to mitigate draining issues on the property

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application F2020-0031, 100 Menendez Road, with the staff condition for archival

documentation based on the staff report and additional comments which offered no basis for denying the application. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, MacDonald, Benoit, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Planning and Building Staff Communications

7.(a) Planning and Building Staff Approved Permits Reports

(Provided for informational purposes only)

Ms. Wolfe noted a June 25, 2020 special meeting of HARB at 1:00p.m. to discuss the Resilient Heritage in the Nation's Oldest City grant and Board members confirmed their availability. She added that an update to the survey findings for the West Augustine and Fort Mose historic resource survey would be presented at an upcoming meeting as well.

Ms. Wolfe announced that the National Trust for Historic Preservations would be holding a virtual conference and she encouraged the Board members to participate.

Ms. Wolfe also announced that May was Historic Preservation Month and gave a brief overview of information and virtual events related to the occasion.

8. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 2:35 P.M.⁴



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

⁴ Transcribed by Candice Seymour